

The Impact of Educational Inspection System on Organizational Effectiveness and Individual Sufficiency

Süleyman Göksoy¹, Mahmut Sağır², Şenyurt Yenipinar³

¹Faculty of Education, Educational Sciences, Educational Administration and Supervision, University of Düzce, Düzce, Turkey

²Faculty of Education, Educational Sciences, Educational Administration and Supervision, University of KahramanmaraşSütçü İmam, Kahramanmaraş, Turkey

³Educational Inspectors, Konya, Turkey

Email: goksoys@hotmail.com, msagir_71@hotmail.com, yenipina@gmail.com

Received 22 September 2015; accepted 22 October 2015; published 26 October 2015

Copyright © 2015 by authors and Scientific Research Publishing Inc.

This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution International License (CC BY).

<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>



Open Access

Abstract

The aim of the research is to identify the impact of educational inspection system on organizational effectiveness and individual sufficiency according to educational inspectors' perceptions. The research was carried out with qualitative research method and the participants were 21 volunteer educational inspectors selected from 3 cities in 7 regions in Turkey: Erzurum, Van, Muş, Diyarbakır, Batman, Gaziantep, Hatay, Kahramanmaraş, Adana, Ankara, Konya, Sivas, Sinop, Düzce, Bolu, İstanbul, Tekirdağ, Kocaeli, Uşak, Manisa, İzmir in the 2014-2015 academic year. In the research, various results are obtained about positive and negative impacts of uniting ministry inspectors and provincial educational inspectors in a particular organizational structure named "educational inspectors" on organizational effectiveness and on individual sufficiency. Some suggestions are developed based on these results.

Keywords

Inspection, Organizational Effectiveness, Individual Sufficiency

1. Introduction

The term "effectiveness" is one of the topics in which the impact of positivist methodology in educational management is intensely observed [1]. Effectiveness, in the most general sense, is a term that defines the extent of

achievement of the predetermined goals of an organization [2] [3], is a performance dimension that determines the levels of achieved goals of the organizations in the end of their applications [4], is an ability of an organization to accomplish their goals by using the resources usefully [4]. According to these views, the success of an organization is determined by the achievements of its predetermined goals [5]. Therefore, effectiveness is related to the degree of accomplishment of the common goal. Action is ineffective if it does not lead to the goals. The degree of the accomplishment of a goal is the scale of effectiveness [6]. However, a person and an organization need to be active and sufficient in order to carry out the organizational goal up to the mark [7]. Hence the effectiveness of organizations is an outcome of the high quality product of the organization [8].

Another term related to organizational effectiveness is “sufficiency”. Organizational effectiveness is connected to provide the individual requirements. Providing the sufficient number of members who are open to collaborate in order to achieve the organizational goal is the scale of effectiveness. Willingness to contribute to the common goal is highly related to the satisfaction of individuals in the end of their efforts. If the acquired satisfaction overpasses the given efforts, individuals demonstrates more willingness to contribute to the common goal and organizational effectiveness occurs [9] [10].

Effectiveness of an organization is the result of sufficiency of the individuals who joint effort [9]. It is based on individual sense. If an individual realizes that his very own needs are provided in his work, he continues his contributions to the common effort. If not, he does not contribute any longer. Accordingly, effectiveness of an organization is the power of maintaining its existence by providing individual satisfaction. It can be defined as the power of balance. The power of balance is balancing the individual satisfaction and the individual devotion. The organization maintains its existence with this balance. Bursalıoğlu [11] explains the organizational balance as the relationship between individual’s contributions to the organization such as effort, skills, devotion and provision of the organization in the form of payment, security and embracement. In other words, balance is the correlation between the goals of the organization and the importance given to individual requirements. The percentage of participating members is directly proportionate to encouragement provided by the organization. On the other hand, the stronger connection between organizational goals and individual requirements, the more balanced the organization will be. Inspection is an important application in order to perform the education and training processes in accordance with the predetermined goals.

In Turkey, two separate inspection units are constituted in accordance with the delegated legislation number 652 about The Organization and Functions of Ministry of Education. Presidency of Counselling and Inspection is formed within the ministry and presidency of educational inspectors is formed within the provincial directorate for national education. After this delegated legislation, inspectors within the Ministry of Education are called “ministry inspectors” and the ones within the provincial directorate for national education are called “provincial educational inspectors”. Presidency of Counselling and Inspection is a consultation and inspection unit constituted based on the repealed Regulations of the Organization and Functions of Ministry of Education. Its work was regulated according to the provisions of Ministry of Education Inspection Regulations and Ministry of Education Inspection Instructions. Basis and procedures about the duties of Presidency of provincial educational inspections, election of provincial educational inspectors, their placements, their appointment to inspection, their duties, authorities and responsibilities, working principals, qualifications, backgrounds and displacements were regulated according to Ministry of Education Inspection Regulations which was accustomed based on repealed Regulations of The Organization and Functions of Ministry of Education.

It is a known fact that inspectors have a great role when an educational organization achieves its goal because the degree of achieved goals is related to use the resources productively. This can only be determined by inspection. Inspection process is needed for a productive and a rational management process. Inspection is one of the management processes and it is a counseling service and a vocational assistance that contributes to the development of the system and increment of effectiveness in terms of quantity and quality [12]. Since the organizational effectiveness is to meet the expectations of the organization and the organizational sufficiency is to provide the needs of members, it can be said that organizational balance is the balance of expectations and needs.

Success of educational systems is measured with its effectiveness and productiveness [13]. Considering the organizational effectiveness and sufficiency in terms of uniting ministry inspectors and provincial educational inspectors under the name of “educational inspectors”, it should be investigated whether this regulation provides and balances the organizational expectations (effectiveness) and individual requirements (sufficiency). Because organizations should observe the alterations in their environments and should make the necessary alterations in themselves right on time in order to maintain their existence and compete with the other organizations [14].

In the study about the possible impacts of uniting inspection systems within Ministry of Education on organizational effectiveness and on individual sufficiency carried out by Göksoy and others [15], the following possible positive reflections on organizational effectiveness are determined: quality and productivity will increase, costs, time and workforce will be saved, professions will increase, inspectors will recover from the impact of provincial directorate for national education, experiments will be shared, Ministry of Education will serve better and provide hierarchical equivalence, new norms, values and common purposes will occur, the duties will be carried out by a particular center with a holistic approach, corporation will be created in applications, new inspection culture will be developed, innovation and alteration process will start, synergy will be created, vocational definitions will be clarified, more productive and more amount of work will be carried out, organization will be embraced. The following possible negative reflections on organizational effectiveness are determined: There may occur some contradiction within groups due to the differences in personal rights. These kinds of negotiations can be decreased by arranging the legislations in this process and by organizing educational applications.

The possible reflections on individual sufficiency are as follows: job satisfaction and motivation will increase, respectability and reputation will develop, level of burnout will decrease, institutional learning will occur, personal and vocational development will be supported, social and personal rights will be improved, individual learning will be affected positively, more objective decisions will be made, expertness knowledge and experiences will be shared, self-confidence will increase; ministry inspectors' motivations may decrease, fear of failure and fear of being misunderstood may lead to divergence from organizational goals, compliance problems may decrease the organizational devotion and different payments for the same work may destroy the work peace.

According to Barnard, an organization maintains its existence only if it keeps the balance between organizational goals and individual goals [16]. This study aims to determine the reflections of educational inspection system on organizational effectiveness and individual sufficiency based on the perceptions of educational inspectors. For this purpose, answers of the following questions have been searched:

- a) What are the impacts of educational inspection system on organizational effectiveness (level of accomplishing organizational goals and functions)?
- b) What are the impacts of educational inspection system on organizational sufficiency (providing individual requirements, improving personal rights, etc.)?

2. Method

The research was carried out with qualitative research method. Since a phenomenon was aimed to be examined thoroughly in its own reality, qualitative research method was found appropriate. Phenomenologic method was used in the research. Phenomenologic method is the center of qualitative research method [17]. Phenomenologic method focuses on phenomena that is known but not examined intensely and deliberately [8].

3. Working Group

Purposive sampling, correspondingly maximum variation sampling method and criterion sampling method were used in determining the working group of the research. Purposive sampling allows examining the occasions which are informationally rich [18] [19]. Participants of the working group are selected based on the criteria that they are not inspector candidates and that they have been educational inspectors or ministry inspectors for at least 3 years. It is thought that the working group would have more awareness of the issue if they comply with the criteria. One volunteer educational inspector from each 3 cities in each 7 regions in 2014-2015 academic year in Turkey is selected in order to provide maximum variation. Therefore, 21 educational inspectors working in Erzurum, Van, Muş, Diyarbakır, Batman, Gaziantep, Hatay, Kahramanmaraş, Adana, Ankara, Konya, Sivas, Sinop, Düzce, Bolu, İstanbul, Tekirdağ, Kocaeli, Uşak, Manisa, İzmir are determined as the working group of the research. Information about the participants is given in **Table 1**.

According to the data in **Table 1**, 52% of the educational inspectors participating in the research have bachelor's degree, 43% have master's degree and 5% have PhD degree. In terms of service years of inspection, 29% of them have 6 - 10 years; 38% of them have 11 - 15 years; 19% of them have 16 - 20 years and 14% of them have 25 years and more inspection experiment. 14% of them have the least service years of inspection and it is 25 years and more.

Table 1. Personal information of provincial educational inspectors.

Variables	Sub-Categories	f	%
Gender	Female	3	14
	Male	18	86
	Associate	-	-
Educational status	Bachelor's	11	52
	Master's	9	43
	PhD	1	5
Service years of inspection	1 - 5 years	-	-
	6 - 10 years	6	29
	11 - 15 years	8	38
	16 - 20 years	4	19
	25 and more	3	14

4. Data Collection Tool

Interview is the primary data collection tool in the phenomenologic [20]. Semi-structured interview form developed by the researchers was used in the study. Semi-structured interview form allows interviewee to explain themselves [19]. In the preparation process of the form, websites of educational inspectors were observed, literature and legislation were reviewed and an interview with educational inspectors and academicians were arranged. A question pool (two questions) was created based on the information gathered in these interviews. The questions were broached to four educational inspectors and one academician. After necessary arrangements, the interview form was developed and two more questions were included. Educational inspectors (2 people) who did not attend the working group were consulted about the semi-structured interview form and the content adequacy was controlled. After some conceptual arrangements, the form was put into final form. Interview forms were analyzed by two researchers, how the results were obtained was explained deliberately, critical and comparative analysis in the data interpretation process was included and they were submitted with first hand citations in order to increase the reliability and present the transmissibility function of the research.

5. Data Analysis

Descriptive analysis was used as a qualitative data analysis method in data analysis. During interviews, the answers of educational inspectors were noted down by means of getting their permissions. For this purpose, educational inspectors from Sinop, Düzce, Bolu, İstanbul, Tekirdağ, Kocaeli, Ankara, Kahramanmaraş, Konya, Sivas were interviewed face to face for nearly one and half an hour. Educational inspectors from the other cities were sent the interview forms online and also they were interviewed online. Their answers were written down instantly and the answers were read and sent via e-mail in order to take their approval. Participants were presented with the abbreviation *Educational Inspectors (EI)* and each participant was given a number in order to provide secrecy. After then the data were grouped based on themes and content analysis was performed. The themes were determined according to related literature, the codes were written, a content analysis which was suitable for qualitative research was endeavored and findings were submitted.

6. Findings

The findings obtained from the interviews are given tabular. The views of educational inspectors participated in the study and findings and interpretations of the sub problems are given below.

A: Positive reflections of educational inspection system on organizational effectiveness

Educational inspectors' views on how educational inspection system contributes to organizational effectiveness are given in **Table 2**.

Table 2. Positive reflections of educational inspection system on organizational effectiveness.

Effectiveness Theme	N
It has provided saving in cost, time and labor.	21
It has provided hierarchical balance.	19
It has provided unity in applications by centralizing tasks in holistic approach.	19
Work definitions have become clear.	18
It has enabled the exchange of experiences.	16
It serves better for the goals of Ministry of Education.	15
Educational inspectors have been working more productively.	13
Quality and productivity have increased.	11
Expertise in the fields has increased.	2
It has created synergy.	2
It has formed a brand new inspecting culture.	2
It has increased the protection of the organization	2
It contributed to the formation of new norms, values and common goals.	1
It enabled more independence.	1
It enabled to enter the innovation and change process.	1

Upon analyzing the table, participators state that the positive reflections of educational inspection on organizational effectiveness are as follows: It has provided saving in cost, time and labor (n = 21), It has provided hierarchical balance (n = 19), It has provided unity in applications by centralizing tasks in holistic approach (n = 19), Work definitions have become clear (n = 18), It has enabled the exchange of experiences (n = 16), It serves better for the goals of Ministry of Education (n = 15), Educational inspectors have been working more productively (n = 13), Quality and productivity have increased (n = 11), Expertise in the fields has increased (n = 2), It has created synergy (n = 2), It has formed a brand new inspecting culture (n = 2), It contributed to the formation of new norms, values and common goals (n = 1).

Participators of the working group are posed a question, “What are the contributions of educational inspection system on organizational effectiveness?” and their statements are summarized below.

Statements of some participants are analyzed and their views are as follows: “... it was a very necessary situation that ought to happen (EI 1)”, “Although it is seemingly under a single roof, it continues its existence as two separate roofs. Constructive transformation in inspection has not been solved yet (EI 14, 15)”, “It is hard to say that there has been a big change. Educational inspectors who are appointed in the center are doing the tasks of earlier ministry inspectors. They united constructively but the actual state has not changed (EI 7)”, “...hegemony on one another has come to an end (EI 2)”, “Entropy arising from contradictions between two groups has diminished (EI 4)”, “It enabled standardization (EI 8).”, “That Counselling and Inspection Presidency can give directions to provincial presidencies contributes to coordination (EI 10)”, “Thesis that it will increase the functionality of inspection has not been proved (EI 13)”, “...it has been insufficient in achieving the goals due to the wrongness of unity (EI 15)”, “Inspection of all ministerial institutions by one particular organization has been more effective and the same approaches have been observed (EI 16).”

B: Negative reflections of educational inspection system on organizational effectiveness

Educational inspectors’ views on how educational inspection system creates negation to organizational effectiveness are given in **Table 3**.

Upon analyzing **Table 3**, all participators state that the negative reflections of educational inspection on organizational effectiveness are as follows: Involvement to Ministry of Education has affected effectiveness in inspection negatively (n = 21), Presidency, dictatorates of national education and abroad governance have been omitted out of inspection (n = 20), Different payments have been affecting motivation negatively (n = 20), Sub-

Table 3. Negative reflections of educational inspection system on organizational effectiveness.

Ineffectiveness Theme	N
Involvement to Ministry of Education has affected effectiveness in inspection negatively	21
Presidency, directorates of national education and abroad governance have been omitted out of inspection.	20
Different payments have been affecting motivation negatively.	20
Subordinates have started to inspect superiors, which is unfeasible.	17
Precariat inspection member damaged the objectivity.	10
That ministry inspectors were provided with deductible degree damaged fairness principle.	3
Individual latent contradictions have been experienced.	2
Superior inspection members were appointed to work in the service of subordinate inspection members.	2
Compliance problem has been experienced.	1

ordinates have started to inspect superiors, which is unfeasible (n = 17), Precariat inspection member damaged the objectivity (n = 10), ministry inspectors were provided with deductible degree damaged fairness principle (n = 3), Individual latent contradictions have been experienced (n = 2), Superior inspection members were appointed to work in the service of subordinate inspection members (n = 2) and Compliance problem has been experienced (n = 1).

Participants of the working group are posed a question, “What are the negations that educational inspection system brought to organizational effectiveness?” and their statements are summarized below.

Participants’ direct opinions on this subject are as follows: “This unity should have happened at ministerial level, however, it was degraded to city. This situation inactivated inspection mechanism... (EI 8)”, “Everybody focused on working collaboratively (EI 6)”, “Mostly latent, sometimes apparent contradictions have been experienced due to prejudice and negative admissions (EI 13)”, “... it may be too early to predict what this change will bring (EI 10)”, “Ministry inspectors reproach about working with provincial educational inspectors under a single roof and within the scope of directorate of national education (EI 1)”, “Lack of knowledge about how to make assignment in the center abused confidence (EI 14)”, “There has not been a big change since most of the ministry inspectors have been assigned in the center (EI 16)”, “No negativity have been experienced (EI 17)”.

C: Positive contributions of educational inspection system to individual sufficiency

Educational inspectors’ views on how educational inspection system contributes to individual sufficiency are given in **Table 4**.

Upon analyzing **Table 4**, positive reflections of educational inspection system on individual sufficiency can be listed as follows: Self-confidence has increased (n = 17), Expertise knowledge and inspection experiences have been exchanged (n = 16), Academic development has been created by increasing in-group learning (n = 15), Expectancy of improvement in social rights and personal rights in the long term has risen (n = 15), Employees of two institutions have shared their knowledge (n = 14), Vocational respect/reputation has increased (n = 14), The term ‘educational inspector’ has become inclusive (n = 12), Decisions have been taken more objectively (n = 10), Personal and vocational improvement have been affected positively (n = 9), Level of burnout has decreased (n = 6) and it has positive effect on individual learning (n = 4).

Participants of the working group are posed a question, “What are the contributions of educational inspection system to individual sufficiency?” and their statements are summarized below.

Statements of some participants are analyzed and their views are as follows: “Uniting under a single roof slightly improved the quality and it contributed morally (EI 2, 6)”, “... it created job satisfaction (EI 6)”, “... motivation has increased (EI 8)”, “It improved vocational effectiveness and enhanced vocational reputation in society (EI 7)”, “It formed new norms and values on an individual basis. It developed adaptive skills in individuals and enhanced emphatic skills of each group members (EI 1, 7)”, “Unity of two constructions have not contributed to individual sufficiency (EI 16)”, “... educational inspectors started to feel more comfortable about themselves, and it increased their motivation. This situation helped them get over the feeling of burnout (EI 11)”, “Each group members expanded their knowledge. It is a nice start to improve a common culture (EI 13, 14)”.

Table 4. Contributions of educational inspection system to individual sufficiency.

Sufficiency Theme	N
Self-confidence has increased.	17
Expertise knowledge and inspection experiences have been exchanged.	16
Academic development has been created by increasing in-group learning.	15
Expectancy of improvement in social rights and personal rights in the long term has risen.	15
Employees of two institutions have shared their knowledge.	14
Vocational respect/reputation has increased.	14
The term 'educational inspector' has become inclusive.	12
Decisions have been taken more objectively.	10
Personal and vocational improvement has been affected positively.	9
Level of burnout has decreased.	6
It has positive effect on individual learning.	4

D: Negative reflections of educational inspection system on individual sufficiency

Educational inspectors' views on how educational inspection system creates negation to individual sufficiency are given in **Table 5**.

Upon analyzing **Table 5**, all participators state that the negative reflections of educational inspection on individual sufficiency were as follows: The thought that fairness and equality principles are not followed and it spread (n = 21), Motivation of educational inspectors decreased (n = 17), Different payments for the same work affected work peace negatively (n = 17), Devotion to the institution diminished (n = 10), The name 'educational inspector' did not get enough admission (n = 3), Protecting individual achievements caused to deviate from the institutional goals (n = 2), Fear of failure and insufficiency arose (n = 2), No negativity has been experienced (n = 2).

Participators of the working group are posed a question, "What are the negations that educational inspection system created to individual sufficiency?" and their statements are summarized below.

Statements of some participants are analyzed and their views are as follows:

"Ministry inspectors dropped behind in their statue. This situation brought some problems. Provincial educational inspectors started to think that they had less financial rights than ministry inspectors had. Therefore their motivations and organizational devotion levels decreased. (MF 12)", "Psychological and social adaptation problems in the process of adaptation to a new situation caused institutional devotion of two group members. Accordingly, the members had an increasing request to leave the institution (MF 1)", "Uniting two constructions did not affect individual sufficiency negatively (MF 21)", "Different payments for the same work affected work peace negatively. (MF 5)", "Different payments for the people who works in the same degree, in the same unit and for the same work caused tension (MF 8)", "Current situation will be reformulated (MF 7)", "Ministry inspectors realised that provincial educational inspectors' job was very hard. There has been no improvement in personal rights (MF 6)", "Inspections are postponed due to the dilemma of the institution. Members cannot work peacefully (MF 2)", "Ministry inspectors think that their statue and authority are seized from them (MF 8)", "Ministry inspectors are incorporated in provincial educational inspectors. Nothing has changed for provincial educational inspectors (MF 16)", "Neither of the groups won (MF 13)".

7. Result—Debate and Suggestions

In this research, reflections of educational inspection system on organizational effectiveness and on individual sufficiency are analyzed within the frame of educational inspectors' views. The following results are obtained from the research.

a) In terms of positive reflections on organizational effectiveness, participators are of the opinion that educational inspection system provides cost, time and workforce savings, creates hierarchical balance, provides unity

Table 5. Negative reflections of educational inspection system on individual sufficiency.

Insufficiency Theme	N
The thought that fairness and equality principles are not followed and it spread.	21
Motivation of educational inspectors decreased.	17
Different payments for the same work affected work peace negatively.	17
Devotion to the institution diminished.	10
The name 'educational inspector' did not get enough admission.	3
Protecting individual achievements caused to deviate from the institutional goals.	2
Fear of failure and insufficiency arose.	2
No negativity has been experienced.	2

in applications by centralizing tasks in holistic approach, clarifies job definitions, enables the exchange of experiences, serves better for the goals of Ministry of Education, encourages educational inspectors to work more productively, increases the quality and productivity, enhances the expertise in the fields, creates synergy, forms a brand new inspecting culture, contributes to the development of new norms, values and common goals. These findings correspond to the results of the researches carried out by Göksoy and others [15], Hoşgörür and Hoşgörür [20], Yildirim and others [21], Memduhoğlu and Taymur [22]. In these researches, it is found that the current dual structure in educational inspection system should be demolished and inspection system should be integrated.

b) In terms of negative reflections on organizational effectiveness, it is found out that different payment among educational inspectors affects motivation and effectiveness negatively. This result corresponds to the results of the research by Göksoy and others [15]. Apart from that, participators are of the opinion that involvement to directorate of national education affects effectiveness in inspection adversely, that presidency, directorates of national education and abroad governance have been omitted out of inspection, that Subordinates have started to inspect superiors, and that precariat inspection members damaged the objectivity. Also they state that ministry inspectors were provided with deductible degree and this situation damaged fairness principle. Participants assert that individual latent contradictions have been experienced and that superior inspection members were appointed to work in the service of subordinate inspection members.

c) In terms of positive reflections on individual sufficiency, participants are of the opinion that with educational inspection system, self confidence increased, expertise knowledge and inspection experiences have been exchanged, academic development has been created by increasing in-group learning, expectancy of improvement in social rights and personal rights in the long term has risen, employees of two institutions have shared their knowledge, vocational respect/reputation has increased, the term "educational inspector" has become inclusive, decisions have been taken more objectively, personal and vocational improvement have been affected positively, level of burnout has decreased and it has positive effect on individual learning. These results correspond to the results of the research carried out by Göksoy and others [15].

d) In terms of negative reflections on individual sufficiency, the results are as follows: The thought that fairness and equality principles are not followed, motivation of educational inspectors is decreased, different payments for the same work affect work peace negatively and it does not contribute to personal rights. This result corresponds to the results of researches that Göksoy and others [15] and Kocabaş and Yirci [23] carried out. Both of the studies found out that inspectors should have the same personal rights with the inspectors from other institutions in order to increase motivation among them. However, that protecting individual achievements do not lead to deviation from the institutional goals and that there is no fear of failure and insufficiency do not correspond to the results of the study carried out by Göksoy and others [15].

These suggestions have been developed based on research data:

- Uniting ministry inspectors that work within the ministry and provincial education inspectors who work within the directorate of national education in a one particular organizational construct under the name of "educational inspector" reflected positively on organizational effectiveness. Uniting works should be maintained.

- Personal and financial rights should be equalized in order educational inspection to reflect on individual sufficiency positively and in order to increase educational inspectors' authority and self confidence.
- Educational inspectors should be separated from directorate of national education in order to provide them an effective and comfortable working environment.
- Orientation and in-service training activities should be arranged to prevent any problems among educational inspectors. It will also help them generate a new inspection culture.
- Educational inspectors should be improved enough to inspect all units of the presidency.

References

- [1] Yılmaz, K. and Taşdan, M. (2006) İlköğretim Okulu Yöneticilerinin Okul Yönetimin de Etkililik Hakkındaki Görüşleri. *Journal of Faculty of Educational Sciences*, **39**, 125-150.
- [2] Bilgin, K.U. (2004) Kamu Performans Yönetimi. TODAİE Yayınları, Ankara.
- [3] Çuhadar, A.İ. and Erdoğan, N. (2011) E-Devlet Ve Etkililik: Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı Taşınır Mal Yönetmeliği Modülü Örneği. MEB, Milli Eğitim Dergisi, 191, Ankara.
- [4] Horngren, T.C., Foster, G. and Datar, M.S. (2000) Cost Accounting a Managerial Emphasis. 10th Edition, Prentice Hall International, Inc., London.
- [5] Aldemir, M.C. (1985) Örgütler Ve Yönetimi. Makro Bir Yaklaşım, İzmir.
- [6] Tanrıoğen, A. (1988) Okul Müdürlerinin Etkililiğiile Öğretmen Morali Arasındaki İlişkiler. Yayınlanmamışdoktoratezi, Hacettepe Üniversitesi Sosyal BilimlerE nstitüsü, Ankara.
- [7] Başaran, İ.E. (1982) Örgütsel Davranışın Yönetimi. Ankara Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Fakültesi Yayınları, Ankara.
- [8] Yörük, S. and Koca, T. (2011) İlköğretim Okullarında Görev Yapan Kadın Öğretmenlerin Performanslarının Arttırılmasında Okul Yöneticilerinin Etkililiği: Afyonkarahisar İli Örneği. *Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi/Cilt: XIII, Sayı 1*, Haziran.
- [9] Aydın, M. (1991) EğitimYönetimi. HatiboğluYayınevi, 3. Baskı, Ankara.
- [10] Yükcü, S. and Atağan, G. (2009) Etkinlik, Etkililik Ve Verimlilik Kavramlarının Yarattığı Karışıklık. *Atatürk Üniversitesi İktisadiveİdari Bilimler Dergisi, Cilt: 23, Sayı: 4*, Erzurum.
- [11] Bursalıoğlu, Z. () Okul Yönetiminde Yeniyapıve Davranış. Pegem A Yayıncılık, Ankara, No. 9.
- [12] Yıldırım, İ. and Koçak, Ş. (2008) Eğitimdenetimindeilköğretim müfettişleri yetiştirilmesivesorunları. <http://www.cu.edu.tr/insanlar/kocaks/ilk%C3%B6%C4%9Fretim%20m%C3%BCfetti%C5%9Fleri.html>
- [13] Turan, S. (2006) Eğitim Liderliği. Okul Yönetimlerini Geliştirme Programı Ders Notları, MEB İlköğretim Genel Müdürlüğü, Ankara.
- [14] Peker, Ö. (1995) Yönetimi Geliştirmenin Sürekliliği. Türkiye Ortadoğu Amme Dairesi Enstitüsü Yayınları, No. 258, Ankara.
- [15] Göksoy, S., Sağır, M., Yenipınar, Ş., Emen, E. and Aksoy, C. (2014) Yapısal Değişimin Örgütsel Etkililiğeve Bireysel Yeterliliğe Etkisi. VI. Uluslararası Katılımlı Eğitim Yönetimi Kongresi, Yıldız Teknik Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi, Haziran, İstanbul, 18-20.
- [16] Lunenburg Fred, C. and Ornstein, A.C. (2013) Educational Administration (Eğitim Yönetimi Çeviri Editörü: Gökhan Arastaman). Nobel Yayınları 6, Baskı, Ankara.
- [17] Maeir, P. and Warren, A. (2000) Integrating Technology in Learning and Teaching: A Practical Guide for Educators. Kogan Page, London.
- [18] Büyüköztürk, Ş., Kılıç, Ç.E., Akgün, Ö.E., Karadeniz, Ş. and Demirel F. (2012) Bilimsel Araştırma Yöntemleri (Geliştirilmiş 11. Baskı). Pegem A Yayıncılık, Ankara.
- [19] Yıldırım, A. and Şimşek, H. (2006) Nitelaraştırmayöntemleri. SeçkinYayıncılık, Ankara.
- [20] Hoşgörür V. and Hoşgörür, T. (2012) Eğitimdenetim Sorunları 4. Uluslararası Eğitimdenetimi Kongresi, BildiriKitabı, Tüm Eğitimcilerve Eğitim Müfettişleri Sendikası Yayını, Ankara.
- [21] Yıldırım, M.C. Beycioğlu, K., Uğurlu, C.T. and Sincar, M. (2011) Eğitim Müfettişlerinin Görev Alanları Boyutunda Karşılaşılan Sorunlar, 3. Uluslararası Eğitimdenetimi Kongresi, Bildiri Kitabı. Tüm Eğitimcilerve Eğitim Müfettişleri Sendikası Yayını, Ankara.
- [22] Memduhoğlu, H.B. and Taymur, A. (2009) Türkiye'de Eğitim Denetiminin Yapılandırılmasına İlişkinBir Model Önerisi 1. Uluslararası Eğitimdenetimi Kongresi, Bildiri Kitabı.
- [23] Kocabaş İ. and Yirci R. (2011) Denetmen Algılarına Göre Denetimde Yaşanan Sorunlar, 3. Uluslararası Eğitimdenetimi Kongresi, Bildiri Kitabı, Tüm Eğitimcilerve Eğitim Müfettişleri Sendikası Yayını, Ankara.